Reviewer’s report

Title: The impact of ICDAS on occlusal caries treatment recommendations for high caries risk patients: an in vitro study

Version: 2 Date: 08 Feb 2019

Reviewer: Sophie Doméjean

Reviewer’s report:

Review for BMC Oral Health

Manuscript number OHEA-D-18-00391R2

Title The impact of ICDAS on occlusal caries management recommendations for high caries risk patients

Overall appreciation

The authors took into account almost all suggestions, but the reviewer thinks that the manuscript still needs minor revisions to be accepted for publication in BMC Oral Health.

Terminology

The problem with terminology is still persisting. The distinction between "caries" and "carious" as well as has to be made. The term "caries" is related to the process (caries process) or the disease (caries disease). When referring to a lesion, the authors must say/write "carious lesion", "occlusal carious lesion" (e.g. modify "occlusal caries" line 20 in background chapter). I know that some academics do not make the difference, but this is not a reason for not using the latest terminology…

ICCMSTM means international caries classification and management system; thus, there is no need to add "caries management system" after the acronym in "Methods" lines 46 and 48.

Spelling mistakes

Despite I am not an English native speaker, I see some spelling mistakes in the text (e.g. "cvitated" instead of "cavitated" line 26 in background chapter; "therapeutics sealants" must be "therapeutic sealants").

The text needs to be double-checked and corrected.
Methods

- The authors described the profile of the five examiners in the revised version, but the text is not easy to follow: the authors successively described examiner 1; 4; 5; 2; 3. It would be more pertinent in the methods to change the number associated to each examiner. In other words; 1 stays 1; 4 should be 2; 5 should be 3; 2 should be 4 and 3 should be 5. Of course, tables must be rearranged.

Results and Tables

- Tables must be rearranged according to the previous comment.

References

- Ref 27: please remove the capital letters in the title "Association Between Visual Inspection, Caries Activity Status, and Radiography with Treatment Decisions on Approximal Caries in Primary Molars."

- Ref 28: idem in "A Systematic Review"

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

No

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I recommend additional statistical review

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:
Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

'I declare that I have no competing interests'

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal