Author’s response to reviews

Title: Supernumerary kidneys: a clinical and radiological analysis of nine cases

Authors:

Peter Rehder (peter.rehder@tirol-kliniken.at)
Rafael Rehwald (rr538@cam.ac.uk)
Julia Böhm (Julia.Boehm@student.i-med.ac.at)
Astrid Grams (astrid.grams@i-med.ac.at)
Alexander Loizides (alexander.loizides@i-med.ac.at)
Jannik Stühmeier (Jannik.Stuehmeier@i-med.ac.at)
Marcjo Pedrini (marco.pedrini@tirol-kliniken.at)
Bernhard Glodny (bernhard.glodny@i-med.ac.at;rr538@cam.ac.uk)

Version: 1 Date: 21 Feb 2019

Author’s response to reviews:

Dear Professor Zhang!

Thank you very much for your quick response and editorial efforts. We highly appreciate your comments and suggestions for improvement.

Please allow us to respond to the points raised in the following:

(1) It is of course absolutely right to raise the issue of individual patient consent and we are fully aware of and adhere to all “best practice standards” regarding this issue. As our study covers a timeline beginning more than two decades ago covering thousands of patients screened retrospectively, we have despite this challenge and our very best efforts not had the chance to obtain individual patient consent from these 9 cases before they have either mostly deceased, changed their contact details or have otherwise been “lost”. As much as we agree with individual patient data protection and the best possible research ethics, we are afraid that we will now not be able to provide individual patient consent. This issue has also been brought to the attention of the institutional research ethics committee during the approval of this retrospective investigation.

However, as we would be very honored to share our findings with a broad scientific community by the means of a prestigious publication in our journal, we have decided to remove both the exact age and sex from Table 1 in order to fully eliminate any possibility to potentially identify any individual patient from the publicly available manuscript. Furthermore, we have again screened the text for any potentially harmful information and amended the data-sharing statement that no identifying
information will be shared. We are very much looking forward to your editorial guidance and hope that you will find these measures adequate. In any case, we are very happy to provide you with any additional information regarding the ethical approval of this study, should this be helpful.

(2) We have made the clarifications has requested.

(3) The keywords have been added to the manuscript as requested.

Finally, we can reassure that all authors are now correctly listed on the title page and all authors have approved the manuscript as submitted.

Once again sincerest thanks for your highly appreciated efforts and help and we are looking forward to hear back from you!

With very best wishes

Peter Rehder and Bernhard Glodny
On behalf of all authors