**Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Prognostic significance of the combination of preoperative hemoglobin and albumin levels and lymphocyte and platelet counts (HALP) in patients with renal cell carcinoma after nephrectomy

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 06 Feb 2018

**Reviewer:** James Wysock

**Reviewer's report:**
Overall, study is clearly written and results clearly organized.
Retrospective evaluation of single center assessing prognostic significance of HALP outcomes for patients with RCC undergoing nephrectomy.

Patient/cohort selection - Encourage authors to clarify exactly how patients were identified? Was this a retrospective review of records at the study center? How were cases of RCC identified? Were there cases of RCC that were identified that did not undergo surgery during this time period?

Were HALP values calculated off of pre-op values? Encourage authors to clarify when this measurement was made as it is not clearly stated that this value was calculated from preoperative data.

Remainder of results and interpretation are clear. Low HALP likely marker of systemic inflammation/nutritional status and appears to be associated with worse clinical outcomes. Unclear if this is a reflection of impact on nutrition status from more aggressive disease (i.e. is the more aggressive disease responsible for systemic effects that are reflected by low HALP) or are low HALP prior to disease progression risk factors for worsened outcomes.

Recommend authors clarify patient cohort selection and when HALP was calculated.
Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.
Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.
Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.
Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.
I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:
Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?
6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal