Reviewer's report

Title: Treatment of Renal Angiomyolipoma: Pooled Analysis of Individual Patient Data

Version: 2 Date: 28 July 2015

Reviewer: Angelo Territo

Reviewer's report:

MAJOR COMPULSORY REVISION

The manuscript is interesting and shows a good literature researchs about surgical and minimally invasive (embolization) management of renal angiomyolipoma, a relative rare mesenchymal tumor.

As written, a large number of studies suggested that the risk of bleeding is related to the vascularity and size of this tumour, of course.

- It’s important to underline that, among treatment methods, embolization was associated with a significantly higher risk of re-intervention than a partial nephrectomy. A large series in literature reported enucleation or partial nephrectomy as recommended treatment for renal angiomyolipoma. Than, embolization is considered like a second choice (for example in case of comorbidities that controindicate a surgical treatment), specially in case of large tumors.

- Moreover, the authors didn’t report that angiomyolipoma is a rare mesenchymal tumor arising mainly in the kidney that can potentially behave aggressively. In fact, angiomyolipoma can often resemble sarcomatoid renal cell carcinoma, high grade renal carcinoma or sarcoma. This aspect confirms the importance of to extirpate the neoplasm completely with a surgical approach in particular in case tumor with large size (> 4 cm).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.