Reviewer's report

Title: PRIMARY MELANOMA OF THE PROSTATE

Version: 4 Date: 16 January 2015

Reviewer: Meg Gerstenblith

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting and unique case report of a patient with likely melanoma primary to the prostate. Melanoma involving the prostate is very rare; thus, this case adds a significant contribution to the medical literature. The case report is clearly written and the conclusions are largely supported.

I would suggest the following to improve the manuscript:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The authors state that wide excision is the standard of care for melanoma--but this is the case for primary cutaneous melanoma. The standard surgical care for primary melanoma of mucosal sites is less well established than for primary cutaneous melanoma; the authors should address this (briefly) as it currently sounds like there is a clear standard of care for surgical guidelines for mucosal melanoma, including those arising in the prostate.

2. The authors could consider revising their conclusions that novel immunotherapies could have led to improved survival in this patient; the patient tried two novel immunotherapies, both of which failed. So although these novel treatments are available and in some patients to lead to an improved survival, they certainly do not seem to have in this case.

3. The authors conclude that mutation testing is needed for melanoma cases; while I agree particularly in the context of advanced disease, the authors do not support this conclusion. They do not state why mutation testing is important (i.e. because we have novel therapies that target particular mutations). This needs to be stated and the treatments briefly discussed in order to support that conclusion.

Minor Essential Revisions:

1. Some English language editing is required

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.