Reviewer’s report

Title: Virtual Reality Suturing Task as an Objective Test for Robotic Experience Assessment

Version: 2  Date: 6 August 2014

Reviewer: Ahmed Ghaith

Reviewer’s report:

What do think about “the proctor has limited objective tools to assess surgeon performance”? And how do your test overcome this? Also it cannot test blood loss and operative time.

The choice of metric percentages were developed from the mean and standard deviation of 100 robotic surgeons. Are there criteria for their selection?

You recommend that the surgeons with low MScore may need training prior to patients’ surgery, what is the next step if MScore is high for novices?

For sure there will be differences between novice and experts while performing the test. So, can you conclude a cutoff point that indicates need for robotic training?

I think that the main advantage of the simulator is to improve the skills of surgeons not to determine the need of the beginners to training programs as for sure all novice surgeons need training program prior to live surgery.