Reviewer’s report

Title: A case of IgG4-related kidney disease from the renal pelvis mimicking urothelial carcinoma

Version: 2 Date: 29 January 2015

Reviewer: Ahmed Haddad

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting differential diagnosis of upper tract filling defect. A few points need to be addressed.

MAJOR REVISIONS

1) The authors need to provide a clear background on IgG4 related disease including clearly stating the organs it typically affects, and how frequently.

2) The figure does not show the urogram phase of the CT scan which is typically needed for assessment of upper tract pathology. Also, was ureteroscopy considered in the workup?

3) Are there any features or clues that point to the benign etiology of this condition? For example, in the CT the lesion appears very smooth- is this typical of the IgG4 upper tract lesions reported in the literature. Are there any constitutional symptoms associated with the disease entity. What is the differential diagnosis of other inflammatory diseases that present in a similar fashion?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests