Reviewer’s report

Title: Variation in survival after surgery for peri-ampullary cancer in a regional cancer network

Version: 1 Date: 27 Jan 2017

Reviewer: Neil Merrett

Reviewer’s report:

Thank you for your comprehensive reply which answers the majority of my points

There are just some points which require further clarification

1. I note in your reply that the number of completed resections was around 15%. This comparable with international serieses and should be mentioned in the discussion as indicating that there was no evidence that patients were undertreated

2. Point 7 and 12 the authors have asked for potential papers. I have included some recent australian work which can also be cross referenced to other jurisdictions


Clinically significant under-utilisation of pancreatectomy in geographic regions in New South Wales, with low institutional surgical volumes: a population data linkage study


Factors associated with quality of care for patients with pancreatic cancer in Australia.


Elizabeth Burmeister, Mary Waterhouse, PhD; Susan J Jordan, PhD; Dianne L O’Connell, PhD; Neil D Merrett, FRACS; David Goldstein, FRACP; David Wyld, FRACP; Vanessa L Beesley, PhD; Helen Gooden, PhD; Monika Janda, PhD; Rachel E Neale, PhD

Determinants of survival and attempted resection in patients with non-metastatic pancreatic cancer: an Australian population-based study

Pancreatology. 2016 16(5)873-81. doi: 10.1016/j.pan.2016.06.010.PMID: 27374480

Mary A Waterhouse PhD1, Elizabeth A Burmeister MSc1,2, Dianne L O’Connell PhD3,4,5, Emma L Ballard PhD1, Susan J Jordan PhD1, Neil D Merrett FRACS6, David Goldstein
Determinants of outcomes following resection for pancreatic cancer - an Australian population-based study


3. From the paper, it appears that Multiphase CT with IV and oral contrast was the only staging modality used preop. Were any other staging investigations such as EUS or MRI used in this.

4. Point 11 The authors paper is entitled Variations in survival after surgery. By not including the data on adjuvent therapy, this means that we are only looking at one modality in the treatment of a condition which requires multimodality therapy. Access to this multimodality therapy is important when looking at the effectiveness of concentration of services and the authors should make at least some comment regarding this

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal