Reviewer's report

Title: Robotic transthoracic esophagectomy

Version: 6 Date: 3 August 2014

Reviewer: Maurits de Brauw

Reviewer's report:

The authors are to be congratulated with these excellent results, in terms of complications as well as in the short duration of the procedures. The added video is very clear and useful.

Minor essential revisions:
1. Table I is missing from the data
2. Are these consecutive cases? Has there been a selection of the patients, as to the tumor measurements?
3. Is the learning curve included?
4. What stage had the non-radically removed tumors?
5. What stage had the port site metastases patients? Had these patients more metastases? Could there have been a technical error as reason for these port site metastases?
6. To allow comparison to other results in this observational study it would be very useful to use the Clavien-Dindo classification of complication. Is it possible to add this classification?
7. Could the authors add more data on radiation therapy and chemotherapy before or after the surgery?
8. Is it possible to remove the music from the video?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have received lecture fees from Bard Inc and Covidien, as well as an educational grant from Covidien.