Reviewer’s report

Title: The Correlation between 2D Femoral Notch Parameters and 3D Notch Volume: a Retrospective MRI Study

Version: 0 Date: 14 Feb 2019

Reviewer: Asbjørn Årøen

Reviewer's report:

D-D-19-00200 The Correlation between 2D Femoral Notch Parameters and 3D Notch Volume: a Retrospective MRI Study.

Thanks for the opportunity to review the current manuscript, which touch upon themes that have been discussed for more than twenty years and as noted by the authors there might be a correlation between notch parameters and the risk of Acl injury. Previous research has stated that wider notch is associate with a larger ACL a presumably stronger one. A Japanese study has as conclusion that the finding might only be relevant to Japanese knees and this is problematic in the current study also as only one racial group is included. However, in the paragraph of limitations this is not listed. I am also missing some basic data as the risk of ACL injury in the Chinese population; this is of particular interest for the interpretation of these findings more general in ACL injury prevention. Unfortunately, I am not able to find any reports on individuals with bilaterally injury. This might be the best group to study such predictors as notch dimensions. In conclusion, of my review, I find the manuscript in need of a major revision

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes
Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I recommend additional statistical review

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

None competing interests.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.
I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal

Do you want to get recognition for reviewing this manuscript? Add a record of this review to Publons to track and showcase your reviewing expertise across the world’s journals. Signing up is quick, easy and free!

Yes