Reviewer’s report

Title: Non-contemporaneous bilateral stem fractures occurring after staged bilateral hip revision using extensively porous-coated cylindrical femoral stems: A case report

Version: 1 Date: 30 Nov 2018

Reviewer: S Fokter

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for giving me the opportunity to review your manuscript entitled "Non-simultaneous bilateral stem fracture after staged bilateral hip revision using extensively porous-coated cylindrical femoral stems: A case report". I found the manuscript interesting and well illustrated. The conclusions are sound. I would only suggest to include some recent knowledge on the mechanisms of dual-modular stem failure in primary THA to support your concerns about using modular tapered stems in revision THA (e.g. Fokter SK, Moličnik A, Kavalar R, Pelicon P, Rudolf R, Gubeljak N. Why do some titanium-alloy total hip arthroplasty modular necks fail? J Mech Behav Biomed Mater. 2017 May;69:107-114. and Zajc J, Predan J, Gubeljak N, Moličnik A, Fokter SK. Modular femoral neck failure after revision of a total hip arthroplasty: a finite element analysis. Eur J Orthop Surg Traumatol. 2018 Oct 13. doi: 10.1007/s00590-018-2314-8. [Epub ahead of print] ). Besides, I encourage you to have the manuscript improved by a reader in English.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes
Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Declaration of competing interests**
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests' below.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license ([http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.
I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal

Do you want to get recognition for reviewing this manuscript? Add a record of this review to Publons to track and showcase your reviewing expertise across the world’s journals. Signing up is quick, easy and free!

No