Author’s response to reviews

Title: Anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction with quadriceps tendon-patellar bone allograft: matched case control study

Authors:
Yoon-Ho Kwak (inkwak86@hanmail.net)
Sahnghoon Lee (shlee3219@gmail.com)
Myung Chul Lee (leeme@gmail.com)
Hyuksoo Han (oshawks7@snu.ac.kr)

Version: 2 Date: 29 Dec 2017

Author’s response to reviews:

<Reviewer 1: Umile Giuseppe Longo>

The authors did a good work in addressing the comments. However I do not agree that quad allografts should be recommended in primary ACL reconstruction of patients that are willing to early return to sport. Allografts in young and athletic patients could lead to increased failure. Based on your data (only short 2-years FU, no MRI, no second look) I think it is not correct to suggest a so strong recommendation that could be possibly harmful for patients.

Long-term and wider series are needed to state this. You can state that is a promising alternative for selected and compliant patients, that are willing to not experience donor site, not for athletes.

As you requested, we changed some phrases. First, we changed our opinion in the conclusion from ‘QTPB allograft is implicated as a clinically viable option for ACL reconstruction’ to ‘QTPB allograft for ACL reconstruction is promising alternative to selected and compliant patients’ in line 26-27, page 2 and line 209-210, page 9. Second, we deleted the phrase about recommendation of QTPB allograft for ACL reconstruction to athletes (line 186-187, page 7).

<Joan Carlos Arles Monllau (Reviewer 2)>

Please include all comments for the authors in this box rather than uploading your report as an attachment. Please only upload as attachments annotated versions of manuscripts, graphs, supporting materials or other aspects of your report which cannot be included in a text format.

Please overwrite this text when adding your comments to the authors.

In this time, we include all comments for the authors only in this box, not an attachment.
Dear Editor,

There are no further comments from my side.