Reviewer's report

Title: Functional treatment for fractures to the base of the 5th metatarsal - Influence of fracture location and fracture characteristics

Version: 0 Date: 09 Aug 2017

Reviewer: Ali Al Kaissi

Reviewer's report:

1. Authors throw all their patients in one basket, thirty nine patients enrolled in the study; Are these patients coming form the same biological father and mother?
2. The management described by the authors are not novel and add little to the readers of the journal and can never expand the horizon of knowledge in orthopedics.
3. Authors need to re-assess their patients in accordance with aetiological understanding.
4. Aetiological understanding can be achieved only via full clinical documentation (i.e clinical phenotype) and consequently fracture classifications have to be stemmed from the etiology behind!
5. If the aetiological understanding for fractures is missing, then the whole process of management and prognostication can be vague.
6. Physicians should follow the art of medicine i.e clinical phenotype of every patient. Clinical phenotype is the base line tool has been totally ignored by the authors.
7. Tables should be organized (Age, sex, height, weight, musculo-skeletal, history interinsic bone disorders, metabolic disorders,…and so forth.....)

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess
Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I recommend additional statistical review

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests**
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license ([http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal
Do you want to get recognition for reviewing this manuscript? Add a record of this review to Publons to track and showcase your reviewing expertise across the world’s journals. Signing up is quick, easy and free!

Yes