Reviewer’s report

Title: Bone preserving level of osteotomy in short-stem total hip arthroplasty does not influence stress shielding dimensions - a comparing finite elements analysis

Version: 0 Date: 06 Jun 2017

Reviewer: John Albright

Reviewer’s report:

Because I am not yet certain about the philosophy of this journal and your interest in taking on a wide variety of research topics beyond those that are directly of clinical value. I am uncertain how to advise you about this paper. It is a strictly computerized finite analysis of virtual reality assessment of how implants in the proximal femur will work in the clinical setting in terms of loosening. The problem with mathematical models is they basically represent the first step in the scientific process and do not always correlate with clinical evaluations in the biologic world. I basically have no comments about the scientific merit of this mathematical model since it is a well done PhD based scientific project. In looking through the references for this article, most of them are from basic science research journals such as Journal of Biomechanics, Med Phys EMG, Biomed Tech, J Orthopedic Research, Clinical Biomechanics, etc. My suggestion is that it be recommended to these authors that they find another more suitable journal based on the assumption of the readership of this journal will not really be interested and the power of this message is not actually clinically valued.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics
Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:
Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal

Do you want to get recognition for reviewing this manuscript? Add a record of this review to Publons to track and showcase your reviewing expertise across the world’s journals. Signing up is quick, easy and free!

No