Reviewer’s report

Title: INCIDENCE AND RISK FACTORS OF EXERCISE-RELATED KNEE DISORDERS IN YOUNG ADULT MEN

Version: 0 Date: 09 Apr 2017

Reviewer: Henry Dushan Edward Atkinson

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting study which highlights the frequency of knee disorders and injuries in young men during physically demanding military training.

As many as one-fifth of the male conscripts visited defense force healthcare professionals due to knee symptoms during their service period. The study concluded that age at military service, military service class A, overweight (BMI 25.0-29.9 kg/m2), smoking habit, school education only, self-reported previous symptoms of the musculoskeletal system, self-reported previous symptoms of the respiratory system, and self-reported previous symptoms of the gastrointestinal system were independent factors.

Most of these findings are intuitive, though nevertheless interesting and probably meaningful, given the large numbers included in the study.

The explanations before the association between respiratory and gastrointestinal and knee symptoms were speculative.

The conclusions drawn in this paper must be changed, however. There is no clear cause and effect relationship, and it is too simplistic to state that by targeting the variables that the knee problems will disappear.

"Thus, these risk factors may be targeted for preventive measures to diminish knee disorders and injuries during compulsory military service.", is not a valid conclusion!

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.
No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?
6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.
I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal

Do you want to get recognition for reviewing this manuscript? Add a record of this review to Publons to track and showcase your reviewing expertise across the world’s journals. Signing up is quick, easy and free!

Yes