Reviewer’s report

Title: Multifocal pigmented villonodular synovitis coexisting in both the knee joint and the patella: a case report and literature review

Version: 0 Date: 27 Apr 2017

Reviewer: Toshihiko Nishisho

Reviewer's report:

This is a case report presented PVNS in both the knee joint and the patella. PVNS involving patella is relatively rare and this is a very interesting case, however, there are some points to be not enough for accepting as an academic paper.

1. Change "didn't" to "did not" throughout the manuscript. You should avoid to use short forms in academic paper.

2. Page 4 Line 76: Figure 2 Image findings are not enough. How about T2 star? Please describe more detail. Why did not you perform biopsy? I think it is not typical image of PVNS.

3. Page 5 Line 1: Why do you use iliac bone graft? It looks to be enough to use artificial bone.

4. Page 6 Line 123: I do not know the 50% zinc chloride effect on the PNVS. Could you show the data or paper?

5. Page 7 Line 136: Although preventing recurrence of diffuse PVNS is challenging as you mentioned, radiation for PNVS is controversial because it is benign tumor. Furthermore, this patient is relatively young age, therefore I think it would be better to avoid radiation therapy. Could you show the evidence of radiation for PVNS?

6. You should describe histological findings in more detail.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.
Unable to assess

**Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?**
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests**
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license ([http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)). I understand that any comments
which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal

Do you want to get recognition for reviewing this manuscript? Add a record of this review to Publons to track and showcase your reviewing expertise across the world’s journals. Signing up is quick, easy and free!

Yes