Reviewer's report

Title: Method for the location of primary wear scars from retrieved metal on metal hip replacements

Version: 4 Date: 23 May 2015

Reviewer: Julia Shelton

Reviewer's report:

This version is a good and greatly improved paper. It is clear that the methodology is invaluable and I would expect that the work will be widely used to help understand further details about the failure mechanisms for hip replacements in vivo. There are a few minor issues with the English I think as listed below.

Discretionary revisions

Abstract Ln 24, to locate the location – English needs changing
Introduction Ln 48-49 – does not make sense the English needs changing
Methods, page 3, ln 63 – semicolon unnecessary
Page 4, ln 79, change ‘what concentric zone they were located in ‘ to ‘their location according to the concentric zone ‘
Ln81 change ‘ markers to prevent rotational symmetry’ to ‘ markers for rotational identification’
Page 5, Ln 94 ‘there would have been no way of correctly orientating the explanted cup in vivo’ change to ‘the orientation of the explanted cup in vivo would not have been possible.’

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests