Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of BIS076 in a model of osteoarthritis induced by anterior cruciate ligament transection in ovariectomised rats

Version: 2 Date: 9 December 2014

Reviewer: Gina Lisignoli

Reviewer's report:

The authors have analyzed the effects of a new formulation of natural porcine cartilage extracts (BIS076) in a model of osteoarthritis induced by ACLT in ovariectomized rat. The main criticism of this study is relative to the experimental design that is not clear in different points: number of treated animals/group/treatment, description of the time points analyzed for histopathology, µCT, inflammatory mediators, serum biomarkers. Moreover, since they selected a model that is a mix of two pathologies (osteoarthritis and osteoporosis) to dissect the real effects observed on the different compartments (cartilage, bone) they should consider also a group of only ovariectomized rats and a group of only ACLT treated rats.

Minor point:

1. The background has not a clear sequence of the arguments treated in the paragraphs.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests