Reviewer's report

Title: Concordance between muscle mass assessed by bioelectrical impedance analysis and by dual energy X-ray absorptiometry: a cross-sectional study

Version: 2 Date: 7 November 2014

Reviewer: Atsushi Harada

Reviewer's report:

1. Line 75: Please change its reference ( [1],[2], and [3]) to more representative one, although the description concerning body composition and the reliability of DXA seems to be relevant.

2. Line 86: Is this true? Recently, many studies have examined about the correlation between the muscle mass measured by DXA and by BIA.

3. Line 90: Please more description for diagnosis of sarcopenia by walking speed, grip strength and muscle mass according to EWGSOP algorithm in Methods.

4. This study suggested that the reliability between the particular model of DXA and that of BIA is very high and the comparison of the absolute values by conversion formula become possible. Its significance in diagnosis and treatment of sarcopenia seems to be great. However, in the case of the different models, its reliability will considerably change. Therefore, the authors should add the description about the different models in limitation.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.