Reviewer's report

Title: Surgical Revision for Stump Problems After Traumatic Above-Ankle Amputations of the Lower Extremity

Version: 2
Date: 18 December 2014

Reviewer: Philip Goodney

Reviewer's report:

In their manuscript "Surgical revision for stump problems after traumatic above-ankle amputations of the lower extremity" Liu and colleagues provide a description of their large series of stump revisions. The manuscript is well written, and the photographs nicely illustrate their operative strategies.

My major critique is that the results section omits a discussion of how many patients required advancement of their amputation level (i.e. BKA to AKA), as well as a discussion of the impact of this event on their post-revision functional outcome. This should be added.

Further, it unclear from the results section how long it took patients to improve their ADL scores.

Finally, the discussion reads more like a review article than a summary of the evidence. While the authors have described a nice series, they should be less definitive in the conclusions they draw from their single-center series.