Reviewer's report

Title: Anterior cervical discectomy and fusion may be more effective than anterior cervical corpectomy and fusion for the treatment of cervical spondylotic myelopathy

Version: 2
Date: 9 December 2014

Reviewer: Janez JR Ravnik

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

The manuscript describes metaanalysis comparing two anterior approaches to the cervical spine with spondylotic myelopathy. The analysis is well presented and the conclusion that are derived from it appear to be sound.

I would only have some minor comments and suggestions in the methods, results and discussion section.

In the methods section, I would suggest a table with all the studies listed, accompanied with the name of the first author, the name of the journal, number of patients, year of publication and the language in which the paper was written.

In the results section, a more elaborate qualitative description of the studies would be welcome. The authors should describe how many studies did exactly found a statistically significant difference between both methods.

In the discussion section, other types of surgical approaches to the cervical spine should be mentioned, especially posterior approaches (laminectomy with/without fusion, laminoplasty) and their role in cervical decompression compared to anterior approaches.

Altogether, the metaanalysis seems to be well designed, the methods are well described, and the results seem to be in accordance to the existing knowledge about surgical approaches to the cervical spine. It represents one of a few metaanalysis comparing two different anterior surgical approaches to the cervical spine and it gives a new insight this topic.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I hereby declare that I do not have any competing interests related to this article