Reviewer's report

Title: The effects of a physical activity counseling program after an exacerbation in COPD: a randomized controlled pilot study.

Version: 15 Date: 10 August 2015

Reviewer: Andrew Wilson

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
Now that the power calculation has been presented it is clear that the study was underpowered and that the conclusions drawn by the authors cannot be made. The information in the Future Plans paragraph should be contained in the abstract ie recruitment was difficult and that based on this interim analysis a decision was made not to continue.

Minor Essential Revision

It is not clear when the patients started the study - I assume that this is on discharge given the description of the intervention but the participants were recruited while inpatients.

Confirm in the second paragraph of the results section that complete data were available from the 12 intervention and 15 control participants that finished the study.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'