Author’s response to reviews

Title: The prevalence of overweight and obesity among Iranian military personnel: a systematic review and meta-analysis

Authors:

Yahya Salimi (salimiyahya@yahoo.com)

Maryam Taghdir (mtaghdir@gmail.com)

Mojtaba Sepandi (msepandi@gmail.com)

Ali-Akbar Karimi Zarchi (alikarimi_in1@yahoo.com)

Version: 2 Date: 21 Dec 2018

Author’s response to reviews:

We appreciate the editors of BMC Public Health for providing us the opportunity to re-revise and resubmit this manuscript and look forward to hearing from you soon.

We would like to thank the reviewers for their comments. We have revised our manuscript based on their comments (track change text) and detailed our response to each reviewer. See the comments below:

Editor Comments:

In Abstract Results, it is better to provide subgroups findings rather than quality of studies. In fact, quality of studies should be discussed in Discussion section, why low quality studies are providing lower and high quality studies higher prevalence. Evidence from small studies tends to show not only larger effect sizes but also larger and less precise estimates of between-study heterogeneity (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/25959635). Authors should include some references to support this finding as well.

Thanks, It has been edited and the reference added.

Instead of "researches", authors should prefer "studies".

Thanks, It has been replaced.

In Abstract Conclusion,
"The findings of the present systematic review highlighted the necessity for overweight and obesity prevention programs in military occupational groups" should be omitted as considering high heterogeneity hence low confidence in results don't support the this conclusion.

"......further researches are needed to estimate the prevalence of overweight and obesity in this occupational group." may be stated as, "...large representative studies are needed to estimate the prevalence of overweight and obesity in the military personnel."

Thanks, It has been edited.

**Background**

"According to the World Health Organization (WHO) report, during the 57 past four decades, prevalence of overweight and obesity has been dramatically increased in the 58 general population. In 2016, 39% and 13% of adults in the world were overweight and obese, 59 respectively[2-5]."

In this text,

- reference should be given for WHO report 2xxx.

Thanks, it has been corrected.

- There are 2/3 information's/ data, however, 4 references are provided. Please use references judiciously.

Thanks, it has been corrected.

- Reference [2,6] has been stated twice in subsequent sentences.

Thanks, it has been corrected.

- Page 3 line 60: impose restriction would be more appropriate than imposed limitation

Thanks, it has been corrected.

- Page 4 ... and maintaining... is not applicable for recruitment, hence prefer omitting it.

Thanks, it has been corrected.

- Page 4 line 4: "affect" is better term than "effect" here. "combating" instead of "combat".

Thanks, it has been corrected.
Search Strategy

- I understand that, in your search strategy, there would have been the terms such as "armed forces" "security forces" also. Why you have omitted these terms from search strategy?

Thanks, it has been corrected.

Selection of studies

".... related articles, two reviewers were independently responsible for selecting the articles, which had the inclusion criteria." can be replaced with "related articles, two reviewers conducted literature search independently." for better comprehension.

Thanks, it has been edited.

"...controversy between the two reviewers, it was resolved by negotiation or with the guidance of a third person." should be replaced with "... discrepancy between the two reviewers, it was resolved by negotiation or with the guidance of a third person."

".... in an electronic checklist, which was already prepared in microsoft excel sheet." should be replaced with ".... in pre-designed Microsoft excel data sheet"

Thanks, it has been corrected.

"... third person" is to be replaced with "... third reviewer".

Thanks, it has been corrected.

Results

- "The included studies were conducted mainly in center of Iran, Tehran (n = 6). One study was conducted in the national level. Five of the 10 studies included a sample of all military force units and one study recruited a sample of navy force unit. Based on our eligibility criteria, overweight and obesity status were determined using BMI in all included studies." is to be replaced with "The included studies were conducted mainly Tehran (n = 6). One study was conducted at the national level. Five of the 10 studies included a sample of all military force units and one study recruited a sample of navy force unit."
"Based on our eligibility criteria, overweight and obesity status were determined using BMI in all included studies." this sentence is repeat for Methods Section.

Thanks, it has been corrected.

Discussion and Conclusion: Needs modifications according to comments given for Abstracts.

Thanks, it has been edited.

Study limitations should be given more thoughts: These are rather issues to be included in main discussion.

Thanks, it has been edited. Discussion section: lines 238-240, 275-276, 278-283, and 284-286 pages 11-13.

All the references needs to be rechecked, for example, there are only two ways to write World Health Organization, as "World Health Organization OR WHO".

Thanks, it has been edited.

In addition, still there are many grammatical and typographical errors are present, which could not be ignored. Without addressing them, it is not possible to proceed the paper as well.

The manuscript has been edited by English-speaking native editor. We hope it now matches the journal standard.

BMC Public Health operates a policy of open peer review, which means that you will be able to see the names of the reviewers who provided the reports via the online peer review system. We encourage you to also view the reports there, via the action links on the left-hand side of the page, to see the names of the reviewers.

Reviewer reports:

Takawira Chrispen Marufu (Reviewer 4): Please include all comments for the authors in this box rather than uploading your report as an attachment. Please only upload as attachments annotated
versions of manuscripts, graphs, supporting materials or other aspects of your report which cannot be included in a text format.

Please overwrite this text when adding your comments to the authors.

page 3 line 17 - obesity and overweight are one ... these are two aspects they cannot be one. Please re-phrase the sentence.
Thanks, it has been edited.

Line 27 again check sentence construction - The overweight and obesity are ..., Thanks, it has been edited.

Line 34 consider remove The at the beginning of the sentence.
Thanks, it has been removed.

Page 6 line 9 'relared' is it suppose to be related?
Thanks, it has been corrected.

page 6 line 12 consider The reviewers were not...
Thanks, it has been edited.

page 9 line 41 and 54 check the spelling of analysis not analyses.
Thanks, it has been edited.

Likawunt Samuel Asfaw, MPH (Reviewer 5): The comments were included. Correct minor errors in reference section, better include URL, Dates retrieved. Unless it is a good work
Thanks, the references have been edited.