Title: The prevalence of excessive weight in Balearic Islands' young and middle-aged women and its association with social and socioeconomic factors: A ten-year trend (2000-2010)

Authors:

Josep Ll Coll (pepfarmafeliu@gmail.com)
Maria del Mar Bibiloni (mar.bibiloni@uib.es)
Rogelio Salas (rogersalas1@hotmail.com)
Antoni Pons (antonipons@uib.es)
Josep A Tur (pep.tur@uib.es)

Version: 4
Date: 3 July 2015

Author's response to reviews:

July 3rd, 2015

Dear Editor:

Please, find our manuscript former entitled “Is a ten-year trend (2000-2010) in prevalence of excessive weight among the Balearic Islands’ young and middle-aged women associated with socioeconomic factors?”, and now entitled: “The prevalence of excessive weight in Balearic Islands’ young and middle-aged women and its association with social and socioeconomic factors: A ten-year trend (2000-2010)”, by Josep Ll. Coll, Maria del Mar Bibiloni, Rogelio Salas, Antoni Pons, and Josep A. Tur after we have considered all the views of the Editor and those of the referee of BMC Public Health, as well as a detailed answer.

By submitting the manuscript to BMC Public Health, the authors understand that the material presented in this paper has not been published before neither it has been submitted for publication to another scientific journal or being considered for publication elsewhere. I attest that this work has been approved by all co-authors. The authors also understand that should the submitted material be accepted for publication in the journal, they will automatically transfer the copyright to the publisher.

I hope that the reviewing process finds the manuscript acceptable for publication in the journal.

Sincerely yours,

Josep A. Tur, PhD
Phone: 34-971-173146
Fax: 34-971-173184
e-mail: pep.tur@uib.es
Former title: Is a ten-year trend (2000-2010) in prevalence of excessive weight among the Balearic Islands' young and middle-aged women associated with socioeconomic factors?

Josep Li Coll, Maria del Mar Bibiloni, Rogelio Salas, Antoni Pons and Josep A Tur

Editor's comments:

I have now read the comments from the reviewers (first round of review) and from the remaining reviewer Grossschedl (second review). The remaining reviewer believes that this manuscript can now be accepted. I do not agree because I think there are a number of more formal amendments that are mandatory before any acceptance is possible, and I have listed these mandatory amendments below.

First of all, I want to say that I think the manuscript would be of interest to the journal for two reasons: 1) it gives prevalence and development of trend in overweight and obesity among women on the Balearic islands, and 2) it connects these data with different measures of socioeconomic status and social development.

Title: The title should contain the study design.

According to the Editor comment, the title has been changed to: The prevalence of excessive weight in Balearic Islands' young and middle-aged women and its association with social and socioeconomic factors: A ten-year trend (2000-2010).

Overall writing and style: An external, native and professional English language expert is needed. There are a number of examples for language improvement and revision in the current version of the manuscript. The language problems go all the way from pure misspellings to stylistic problems and awkward formulations which make the text difficult to interpret.

According to the Editor comment, a second review by an English speaking person has been done.

The ethical permission to conduct this study should be clearly stated.

According to the Editor comment, further information has been added.

Results: Table texts should give full information concerning time (When was the study conducted?), place (Where was the study conducted?) and person (Description of the population in terms of sex and age range ad number of participants. Sometimes the study population has a specific name as well.).

According to the Editor comment, further information has been added: "This study included 512 young (18-35 year-old) and 342 middle-aged (36-55 year-old) women living in the Balearics interviewed in the ENIB survey (1999-2000), and 378 young and 252 middle-aged women interviewed in the OBEX survey (2009-2010)." (pls, see page 7, lines 16-18). Since information on age range and number of participants appeared on the tables, further information on place and
surveys' name has been now added to the tables.

Results: Table 1: Why was the mean height lower among women aged 18-35 years in 2009-2010 than in 1999-2000? The trend throughout the western world as well as in most other parts of the world is that height is increasing for both women and men. Was this unexpected result due to selection bias or the increasing proportion of women born in other countries than Spain or some other reason? Please explain and discuss in the Discussion section!

According to the Editor comment, further information has been added (pls, see page 7, lines 24-25; and page 10, lines 27-32).

Discussion: Could the results to some extent have been affected by the fact that the general level of for instance education has risen dramatically? Whitehead for instance discussed this decline in the proportion of the working class as a reason behind changing association between socioeconomic status (education being one of the three main aspects of socioeconomic status) and health outcomes already in 1982 (The Health Divide, Penguin). I think the authors should discuss this problem with the changing proportions of the socioeconomic status groups more.

According to the Editor comment, further information has been added (pls, see page 10, lines 14-21, and new reference (now 46)): "Nevertheless, in recent years, time spent in education has increased in Spain. In 2000 some 23% of 25-64 year-olds and 34% of 25-34 year-olds were enrolled in tertiary education and by 2011, 32% of 25-64 year-olds and 39% of 25-34 year-olds were enrolled in tertiary education [46]. The percentage of young people (15-29 year-olds) not in employment but in tertiary level education also increased from 12.7% in 2008 to 21.4% in 2011, which suggests that some young Spaniards see education as a temporary way out of unemployment and a potential advantage when they try to get back into employment at a later stage [46]."

Conclusion: Both in the abstract and in the conclusion the authors state that education was the only socioeconomic characteristic associate with excessive weight increase among middle aged women, but they do not state the direction of the association.

According to the Editor comment, we added 'low educational level' and changed conclusion writing (pls, see page 12, lines 2-6). We have changed also conclusions In the abstract section.

Referee 2:
Reviewer's report
Title: Is a ten-year trend (2000-2010) in prevalence of excessive weight among the Balearic Islands' young and middle-aged women associated with socioeconomic factors?

Version: 3 Date: 11 May 2015
Reviewer: Franziska Grossschaeidl
Reviewer's report:
Dear Authors, dear Editor,

the manuscript has improved considerably and I accept the revision. I agree with a publication of the paper in that form.

Kind regards,

Franziska Großschädl

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.