Reviewer's report

Title: Mortality among Drowning Rescuers in China, 2013: A Review of 225 Rescue Incidents from the Press

Version: 3 Date: 30 March 2015

Reviewer: Richard C Franklin

Reviewer's report:

Dear Authors
Thank you for your work on revising the previous paper, I provide the following comments in the spirit of improving the paper. See attached file.

Abstract
Number of decimal places is inconsistent (this is also carried throughout the paper).
Who should the rescue skills be promoted too?

Background
You might like to review the following paper as to why people attempt rescues:
Please note the Australian study is not a rate for successful rescue as the number of attempted rescues is unknown. The rate refers to the proportion of victims who survive an rescue attempt where the rescuer drowns.

Material and methods
1st paragraph is too long, consider shortening it or making it into 2 paragraphs.
How many hits did you get from you initial search?
Cases were ‘mainly’ from websites? How much is mainly?
Was the search for articles which contained all of the words or at least 1 of the words?
Would have been nice to also know distance from shore (add this to the limitations).
In the data obtained section for (2) PDVs what is contained in ‘etc’?
In your definition of death, was this reported as death at the scene? Would people who died later be excluded? Depending on how this is answered this should be included in the limitations.

Terms and definitions
Could you provide an example of how you defined a swimming from the media?
report?
When you describe a person as undressing what does this mean? Could it be they took of their shoes or would they take off all their clothing?
Would have been nice to report on data ascertainment, ie the number of case with all variable information and which variables had the most missing information.

Results
1st paragraph – section in yellow (‘which weren’t the provinces with the greatest population’) move to discussion and discuss.

Discussion
Note reference 16 does not refer to Chinese drowning deaths.
1st paragraph is too long, consider shortening it or making it into 2 paragraphs.
I am not sure what you are trying to say with ‘and need to be established in both the individual and the society’.
The following should be made into a separate paragraph and you might also like to think about why children undertake rescue (see previous paper as an example):

Their incompetence at flexible cognitive control, could contribute to the increase in immature decision-making and risk-taking behaviors.[20, 21] Moreover, low risk perception and overestimation of swimming ability which often occur among children with underdeveloped cognition makes them become more impulsive and higher risk-taking.[22] Compared with adult rescuers, more non-swimmers were found among the children in the current study. Therefore, firmly discouraging children from rescuing should be brought into public awareness, as well as possibly safety legislation in the long run.

2nd paragraph is too long, consider shortening it or making it into 2 paragraphs.
Need more detail about reference 17 not sure if it is appropriate or not.
You might like to see recent article from Moran about the difficulty in getting out of the water.
Page 12 5th last line ‘However, few Chinese rescuers performed rescue in water properly.’ How do you know what their technique was like?
The following paragraph needs to be reworked for clarity and purpose, I am not sure what you are trying to say:
Data from Dutch showed that about 31.8% victim accepted resuscitation from bystanders[14]. Topjian et al also found 1/3~1/2 of children could be provided with bystander CPR[32]. The prospective study based on hospital reported 92% patients were resuscitated in Japan[33]. In contrast, the proportion of pre-hospital resuscitation among victims in China was not as high as those aforementioned, leaving substantial room for improvements. Thus the revealing and spreading of
basic first-aid skills to the public were of great importance, especially for those who contacted water frequently due to personal or occupational requirements.

Limitations
See document.

References
17 needs more detail, chapter title etc
25 and 28 same reference.

Tables
Consistency with decimal places

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
None