Reviewer's report

**Title:** The effect of isoniazid preventive therapy on incidence of tuberculosis among HIV-infected clients under pre-ART Care, Jimma, Ethiopia: a retrospective cohort study

**Version:** 4  **Date:** 17 February 2015

**Reviewer:** Gary Maartens

**Reviewer's report:**

The authors have not addressed my comments on the introduction - it is still far too long & they persist with citing old meta-analyses rather than just the 2010 Cochrane review. Although they have added that TST is not a requirement in Ethiopia (which belongs more in the methods) they have failed to summarise the evidence from the meta-analysis that IPT is only significantly effective in TST+ people.

The authors have also still not given the breakdown of TB diagnosis as requested ("how [TB] was diagnosed in the study population")

Finally I requested an incidence rate ratio, which the authors rebut by saying they have given an adjusted hazard ratio, which is not the same.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests