Reviewer's report

Title: The effect of Isoniazid preventive therapy on tuberculosis incidence in adult HIV-infected patients under Pre-ART Care, Jimma University Specialized Hospital, South West of Ethiopia, Retrospective cohort study.

Version: 2 Date: 12 December 2014

Reviewer: Gary Maartens

Reviewer's report:

IPT is an important intervention in HIV-infected people. This retrospective cohort study showed about a 50% reduction in TB incidence, which is similar to what a recent meta-analysis has shown. The 95% CIs were fairly wide. The limitations inherent in the study design and the fact that there is an excellent evidence base already published in this area

1. The introduction is long & rambling - suggest reduce by 50%. Importantly, it does not mention tuberculin skin testing, which is the major determinant of IPT success
2. What method was used to sample the population?
3. The sample size estimates were taken from the first RCT of IPT, which was a small study that showed a bigger effect of IPT than others - the assumptions should rather have been taken from the recent Cochrane review.
4. There is inadequate description of the case definition of TB & how it was diagnosed in the study population
In the results there is needless repetition of data in the tables & text
5. The authors should consider also calculating an incidence rate ratio.
6. The discussion should review their findings with those of the recent Cochrane review (no point in citing older meta-analyses) & of subsequent relevant RCTs

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests