Reviewer's report

Title: A qualitative study of Chinese Canadian fathers' smoking behaviors: Intersecting cultures and masculinities

Version: 2 Date: 2 February 2015

Reviewer: Man Ping Wang

Reviewer's report:

This study explored the perceptions of Chinese fathers' on smoking and quitting with interesting and important findings. Overall the manuscript was well structured. I have several suggestions for improving the understanding of the findings.

First, in the introduction, I think the main focus should put on culture and masculinities about immigrated fathers rather than comparison between general prevalence of smoking between Western countries and China (which should be briefly described only). I think there should be a paragraph described how Chinese culture, especially perceptions on men’s role in affecting smoking and quitting. Having this knowledge will help to understand the specific concept of masculinities. Following this, authors may explain in detail why need to focus on masculinities and report the results of previous qualitative studies (rather than quantitative association of masculine ideals and smoking). If there is any discrepancy between Chinese and Western on masculine ideals and how this is expected to affect the smoking and quitting.

Second, the method section was well written. Authors may need to explain why telephone interview was adopted rather than traditional face-to-face interviews and the limitation of using telephone interviews. What is/are the method(s) used to determine data saturation? How to handle dis-concordant coding?

Third, the findings were summarized appropriately. There are some suggestions for strengthening the discussions. Authors had discussed several key findings such as adherence of Chinese collectivism and Western norm on reducing smoking for family health; self-sacrificed perception of Chinese men, increased caring attitude. There seem several interesting findings were not discussed, these included conflict between traditional culture such as “saving face” and smoking as social networking and Western norm. The discussions can be strengthened if there are systematical explanation of findings based theoretical reasons or authors should explain what are the implication for improving or developing theories for understanding smoking in men. In terms of implications, it seems a bit distracted from the findings. For example, the point on developing health messages were not supported from the findings. Also, the implications for China seems too ambitious that is not directly related to the findings. Instead, I will suggest the authors to discuss more about immigrant Chinese men smoking cessation challenges and how the findings can inform to improve the services.
Authors should also acknowledge the limitation and suggestions for improvements. By improving this, conclusion should also be further tailored to match the findings.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests