Reviewer’s report

Title: Analysis of the emotional experiences of Japanese Alcoholics Anonymous members striving for sobriety

Version: 2 Date: 23 Jul 2019

Reviewer: Reviewer 2

Reviewer's report:

PEER REVIEWER ASSESSMENTS:

OBJECTIVE - Full research articles: is there a clear objective that addresses one or several testable research questions? (Brief or other article types: is there a clear objective?)

Yes - there is a clear objective

DESIGN - Is the current approach (including controls and analysis protocols) appropriate for the objective?

Yes - the approach is appropriate

EXECUTION - Are the experiments and analyses performed with sufficient technical rigor to allow confidence in the results?

Yes - experiments and analyses were performed appropriately

STATISTICS - Is the use of statistics in the manuscript appropriate?

Yes - appropriate statistical analyses have been used in the study

INTERPRETATION - Is the current interpretation/discussion of the results reasonable and not overstated?

Yes - the author's interpretation is reasonable
OVERALL MANUSCRIPT POTENTIAL - Has the author addressed your concerns sufficiently for you to now recommend the work as a technically sound contribution? If not, can further revisions be made to make the work technically sound?

Yes - current version is technically sound

PEER REVIEWER COMMENTS:

GENERAL COMMENTS: This reviewer appreciates the receptivity and responsiveness of the author(s) to previous review comments. As a result, the manuscript is clearer and closer to approval for publication.

ADDITIONAL REQUESTS/SUGGESTIONS:

1. Abstract (page 2, line 31): change "unending" to "iterative," to be consistent with edited text.
2. Abstract (page 2, line 31): delete "the"
3. Background (page 3, line 60): for clarity, change, "...approached sympathetically, and alcohol disorder use has not been viewed..." to "approached sympathetically and, historically, alcohol use disorder has not been viewed..."
4. Background (page 3, line 64): change "alcoholics" to "individuals with alcohol use disorder"
5. Participants (page 7, line 145): change "than" to "from"
6. Creation of emotion list (page 8, line 166): eliminate or close quote.
7. Analysis (page 9, lines 189-200): consider using italics for numbered titles, e.g., Creation of labels, etc.
8. Results (page 10, line 216): clarify order and eliminate redundancy by changing opening line to "Using the KJ method, verbatim transcripts were read carefully..."
9. Results (page 10, lines 222, 227): Move "(Fig. 1) to follow "This schematic" on line 222, and eliminate on line 227.
10. Results (page 10, line 224): change "are" to "were"
11. Wanting others to recognize your existence (page 15, line 345): eliminate "much"
Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

This reviewer has been recruited by a partner organization, Research Square. Reviewers with declared or apparent competing interests are not utilized for these reviews. This reviewer has agreed to publication of their comments online under a Creative Commons Attribution License attributed to Research Square and was paid a small honorarium for completing the review within a specified timeframe. Honoraria for reviews such as this are paid regardless of the reviewer recommendation.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal.