Reviewer’s report

Title: Reduced mentalizing in patients with bulimia nervosa and features of borderline personality disorder: A case-control study

Version: 0  Date: 13 Jul 2018

Reviewer: Federico Amianto

Reviewer's report:

Manuscript number: BPSY-D-18-00433
Manuscript title: Reduced mentalizing in patients with bulimia nervosa and borderline personality disorder features: A case-control study

The paper is well written despite the difficult topic. This research represents an important preliminary analysis concerning a complex psychological dysfunction in the context of Bulimia Nervosa. Some minor revisions need to be done before publishing the paper.

Introduction
The introduction is precise and coherent with scientific background. I only suggest to better argue the concept of comorbidity with the borderline personality disorder (page 4 lines 48-50) because they exist different theories about this item: a more categorical approach is focused on the concept of comorbidity while the phenomenological approach that focused on the concept of different clinical expressions of the same deep problem.

Methods
Concerning the selection of the sample, why do you not also exclude mood disorders? The mentalization impairment is also compromised in these disorders, and if you don't consider this possibility, it could represent a bias in the interpretation of the results. Furthermore it could be important to evaluate the age of illness of patients group and to differentiate patients that had a onset with anorexia nervosa (and than shift to Bulimia) or not.

Discussion
I suggest to the authors to make some hypothesis about clinical implications of this study. Another suggestion is to think about how to turn this preliminary exploration into a more robust and consistent investigation.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.
Yes

**Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?**
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?**
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests**
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal