Reviewer's report

Title: Combining the Suicide Intent Scale and the Karolinska Interpersonal Violence Scale in Suicide Risk Assessment

Version: 2 Date: 12 March 2015

Reviewer: Emilie Olie

Reviewer's report:

The authors propose to measure the predictability of a combination of two scales to identify people at risk of suicide. They consider high-risk patients including only previous suicide attempters. This topic is of great interest. Indeed, many risk factors of suicide are well known, but with very low predictability by themselves. Thus salient measures are still needed to better identify patients that will die by suicide.

Major Compulsory Revisions

BACKGROUND

1. Authors should add information about previous works using a multidimensional approach of suicidal risk including suicide attempt and suicide (for example, Blasco Fontecilla et al. Journal of Psychiatry Research 2012).

2. The authors could better justify their choice of combination of these two scales only.

3. The assessment “Both childhood trauma, adult violent behavior and suicidal behaviour are interlinked. » needs to be justified.

METHODS

4. How do the authors explain the small number of included suicide attempters within 5 years? Could the authors give the number of eligible patients during this period?

5. Suicide intent was assessed for the last suicide attempt. But what about previous behaviors? Would it be interesting to consider also SIS scores of first suicide attempt and/or the most lethal attempt?

6. Is KIVS a validated scale? If yes, in which population(s)?

7. First suicide attempters and major repeaters tend to be two distinct populations. How have the authors taken into account this issue?

DISCUSSION

8. The assessment needs to be reconsidered. « In this study, neither high scores in SIS or KIVS predicted suicide on the short term. However, their combined use
detected the suicide completers in the high risk category from a long term perspective. »

9. The authors should emphasize the interest of using two subscales of the KIVS rather than the global scale.

10. The paragraph “Both scales used in this clinical study reflect underlying neurobiological vulnerability to suicidal behavior. Exposure to interpersonal violence as a child as well as aggression dyscontrol measured with the Karolinska Interpersonal Violence Scale were associated with the serotonin system [23] and suicide intent with low oxytocin [24]. Furthermore, KIVS measures both distal risks in form of early life adversity and developmental factor impulsive aggression, while SIS may also capture more precipitating aspects of suicidal crisis. » is interesting but too évasive concerning neurobiology. Could the authors reconsider this part?

Minor essential revisions

11. Figure 1 is not at the right place.
12. Tables 2 could be deleted adding results into the manuscript.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

None