Reviewer's report

Title: More rumination and less effective emotion regulation in previously depressed individuals with preserved executive functions

Version: 2 Date: 19 September 2014

Reviewer: Ernst Koster

Reviewer's report:

In general this is an interesting study where different aspects of executive functioning and emotion regulation strategies are examined in remitted depressed individuals and controls. In contrast to the previous literature, no evidence was found for influences of EF on rumination and cogn reappraisal.

I think this paper is a valuable addition to the literature. However, several issues need to be addressed (further)

Minor essential revisions

Provided that the finding on EF are a null result it would be good to do a power analysis based on previous data to see whether the current paper has sufficient power to replicate previous findings.

I would like to see a bit more justification of the emotional working memory tasks (the ESST and EWCST). That is, is there any psychometric evaluation of these tasks or any other validation studies that have been done on these tasks? Especially in the light of the null findings it would be good to know whether correlations with the basic EF tasks and the emotional tasks were observed.

In the analyses, the first analyses where the authors try to predict RMD status based on rumination and suppression comes as a bit of a surprise as this does not follow from the introduction.

With regard to the second part of the predictions I wondered whether it would make sense to examine these relations in the subgroup of RMD individuals since EF problems may play a different role in them then in the CTLs

In the introduction it is claimed there is only one study examining emotion specific executive function in remitted depressed individuals. This is not fully accurate as this was also done in:


Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests