Reviewer's report

Title: Early Identification of Women at Risk of Postpartum Depression using the Edinburgh Postnatal Depression Scale (EPDS) in a sample of Lebanese Women

Version: 2 Date: 30 June 2014

Reviewer: Barbara Yawn

Reviewer's report:

Studying the effectiveness of early assessment is important since it might be easier to accomplish than screening at 4 to 12 weeks postpartum.

Major:
1. It is not really clear if the women in the low risk group EPDS 8 or below who were followed were selected randomly or by convenience sample. This could greater affect the outcomes since depressed mothers may be less likely to agree to the interview. This just be clearly specified.
2. The 25% greater risk and the correlation are weak. Yet no discussion of the potential negative impact of this is discussed. Are the authors suggesting that screening be done at D2 and not repeated?
3. Are there any negative impacts of telling a woman she may have PPD at D2 when 'Baby Blues" and effects of the delivery may affect her symptom burden?
4. Of the 33% of those identified on D2, how many would be treated if this was done in the "real world".
5. Of those with MDD diagnosed at 30 to 40 days, how many were treated?

Minor essential:
6. This is a very unusual group of women I believe. What is the percent of women in Lebanon who have graduated from University and who have a graduate degree? The almost 100% feeling of support---of course this is before they have actually needed the postpartum support---is very different than in most countries and could greatly affect the generalizability of the results.
7. In many sites the threshold is 10 --->9 and not 9. What happens when the threshold is changed?
8. This should be accompanied by clinical recommendations. Just screening in a group that is not generalizable to the rest of Lebanon with no further recommendations could be counter-productive.
9. Might want to comment that the recommendations of NICE and SIGN are not evidence based in general and the recommendations for the timing of screening are opinion based by these groups. No current evidence for "rescreening" at 3 months is available.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.