Reviewer’s report

Title: Unintentional Childhood Injury: A Controlled Comparison of Behavioral Characteristics

Version: 3  Date: 18 September 2015

Reviewer: Amy Damashek

Reviewer’s report:

Journal Title: BMC Pediatrics
Manuscript Title: Unintentional Childhood Injury: A Controlled Comparison of Behavioral Characteristics

The authors generally did an adequate job of addressing the reviewers’ comments.

1. One remaining question that I have (which I included last time) refers to the authors’ mention of excluding youth with mental illness. I’m still not clear on how this was assessed. I couldn’t find mention of it in this revision. Did the authors simply ask the parents if the child had a mental illness? How was mental illness defined? Does it include children with oppositional defiant disorder and ADHD? If these children were omitted, it should be noted as a limitation. Relatedly, in the discussion the authors state that the findings “suggest that children with behavioral disorders are more inclined to suffer from unintentional injuries.” This might not make sense if children with behavioral disorders were excluded from the study.

2. When the authors describe the results of the bivariate analyses, they should note the direction of the differences (lines 213-215). For example, was maternal education higher or lower in the injury versus the non-injury group?

3. I recommend omitting lines 304-310.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.