Reviewer's report

Title: A randomized controlled trial of hospital versus home based therapy with oral amoxicillin for severe pneumonia in children aged 3 - 59 months: The IndiaCLEN Severe Pneumonia Oral Therapy (ISPOT) Study

Version: 3
Date: 13 April 2015
Reviewer: Lilliam Ambroggio

Reviewer's report:

The authors responded clearly to the initial review. A few minor points that may still need to be addressed.

1. In the manuscript please cite APPIS study (ref 6) after "Clinical deterioration was defined as appearance of signs of very severe disease such as persistent vomiting (vomiting repeated three times within an hour due to any reason), central cyanosis, grunt, stridor, abnormal sleepiness or difficulty to wake, inability to drink, SpO2 < 85%, convulsions, or death." p.8 line 172

2. Under Cost Outcomes and Economic analysis, the manuscripts states the use of means and standard deviations however in the author’s response cost data was stated to not be normally distributed. Therefore the manuscript should be clear in those sections to only use non-parametric statistics (i.e. median, IQR) and not to use mean and SD. In addition the statement regarding multivariable regression analysis should read "OLS, with log transformation" if that was the final analysis.

3. The author’s response to point 15 regarding LAMA or voluntary withdrawl from the study was informative and should be included in a 1 or 2 sentence explanation in the manuscript as it affects the interpretation of the results and conclusions from this study.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.