Reviewer’s report

Title: Utility and feasibility of integrating pulse oximetry into the routine assessment of young infants at primary care clinics in Karachi, Pakistan: a cross-sectional study

Version: 3  Date: 4 March 2015

Reviewer: Walter Karlen

Reviewer’s report:

The authors have addressed all previous major comments of the reviewers, this has led to a manuscript that is easier to read, with a clearer message. Particularly helpful was the unifying of terms into “primary care clinic” and use of community health workers and study worker.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. A clarification should be still given for parent/caregiver. In the first part of the manuscript only the term caregiver is used. Later in the manuscript (e.g. table3) both terms are used combined. I find the term caregiver in the given context a bit confusing as it suggests these would be medically trained caretakers. Maybe “guardian” is better suited?

2. The feasibility of using pulse oximetry in primary care clinics has been evaluated based on work of 4 study workers (2 at each site). This seems to be a limited number for certain aspects, such as training, expected variability between health workers, reliability of recordings and reliability/robustness of oximeters and required supply chains. It would be favorable if this is better discussed and more clearly communicated. Maybe there is supporting literature or other existing work for these subthemes?

Discretionary Revisions

(lines refer to word document with track changes)

3. The acronym CHW is introduced at line 194, but already used at line 156

4. There is variable use of “one” and “1” minute

5. SpO2 is spelled differently, with O and 0, as well as the 2 is sometimes put subscript and sometimes not

6. L 566: “repeated” instead of repeat

7. What does “well baby visit” mean in table 1?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests