Author's response to reviews

Title: Socio-economic and demographic risk factors on child drowning in Bangladesh

Authors:

Mosharaf Md. Hossain (m_population@yahoo.com)
Kulanthayan Dr. K.C. Mani (kulan@upm.edu.my)
Sherina Dr. Mohd Sidik (sherina@upm.edu.my)
Hayati Dr. Kadir Shahar (hayatik@upm.edu.my)
AKM Fazlur Dr. Rahman (fazlur@ciprb.org)

Version: 4 Date: 4 May 2015

Author's response to reviews:

Reviewer's report-1
Title: Socio-economic and demographic risk factors on child drowning in Bangladesh
Version: 3 Date: 27 June 2014
Reviewer: Gustavo Fraga
Reviewer's report:
Answer: Thanks for your comments
2. Methods: it is not clear how the interviewers were selected. There is nothing about near drowning in this topic.
Answer: Done. In this article only to determinants the risk factors about the drowning deaths rates.
3. Results: lines 148-150 need to be deleted from results, transfer to discussion. The authors need to selected tables or figures to the same information.
Answer: Done
4. Discussion: can be improved comparing the results with literature from diferente countries
Answer: Done
5. Conclusions: don't make any conclusion that is not supported by the results in relation to the aim
Answer: Done
6. Need minor English editing
Answer: Checked by one native English speaker and one statistis experts

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests

Reviewer’s report-2
Title: Socio-economic and demographic risk factors on child drowning in Bangladesh
Version: 3 Date: 4 February 2015
Reviewer: Richard C Franklin
Reviewer's report:
Dear Authors
Thank you for submitting this important work, unfortunately as it currently stands there is a lot of work required to ensure it is publishable. The following comments have been made in the spirit of improving the paper. If you have any questions I would be happy to work with you to improve the paper.

Major Compulsory Revisions
As you are exploring drowning deaths and drowning incidents which did not result in a death you need to be very clear in your language throughout the paper about what you are referring too. I would suggest that for all drowning incidents you use the term ‘drowning’, when you are specifically talking about drowning deaths you use the term ‘drowning deaths’ or ‘fatal drowning’, when you are talking about drowning incidents which did not result in death I would use the term ‘non-fatal drowning’. This process should occur from the beginning of the paper and you might like to define it in the methods. This would bring you into line with your definition you are using from Van Beeck et al. Also later in the paper you introduce further refinement of non-fatal drowning into categories, this needs to be defined in the methods. Please do not use near-drowning as this term is no longer appropriate in the scientific literature.

Answer: Thanks for your good suggestion. I already did inaccroding to your suggestion.

Lines 64-69 Abstract results: This needs work, I would suggest you link it to you aim. Ie Demographic risk factors for child drowning deaths in Bangladesh were: being male (OR), age less than 5 years (OR), mother being illiterate (OR=1.69), and number of children in family being 5 or more (OR=1.95). Common environmental and caring factors were...
You need to explain how your study differs from reference 10 or what extra value
it adds.

I note that your aim (line 120) is about socio-economic and demographic factors, however you also include environmental and caring factors in the methods? Should this be included in the aim and is this the extra value this paper adds?

Answer: Done

The methods need to be expanded. There is no information about how the rates were collected, ie population information used, age standardisation, etc. You have tables and figures representing the same information, you should do one or the other. Also there information missing from the results which you discuss which needs to be include back in. I have provided some suggestion bellow about revising the tables.

The discussion also need some work – see comments on PDF.

Answer: Done

Minor Essential Revisions

Lines 51-52 beginning with ‘Drowning affects’. This sentence does not make sense and needs to be rewritten.

Answer: Done

Line 58-59 Beginning with ‘The Bangladesh Health …” this sentence does not make sense and needs to be rewritten.

Answer: Done

Line 71-72 Beginning with ‘Bangladeshi parents …’ need to be rewritten see PDF comments.

Answer: Done

Line 81 needs a reference at the end of each sentence
Answer: Done

Line 83 needs a reference at the end of the sentence
Answer: Done

Line 92 needs a reference at the end of the sentence
Answer: Done

Line 93 needs a reference at the end of the sentence
Answer: Done

Line 98 needs a reference at the end of each sentence
Answer: Done

Line 99 needs a reference at the end of each sentence
Answer: Done

Line 101 needs a reference at the end of each sentence
Answer: Done

Line 102 – add ‘by single year of Age’ after rate. Also add reference at end of
sentence Every half an hour in Bangladesh a child drowning, this is 50 drowning deaths a day and 18,225 drowning deaths per annum[3].

Answer: Done

Line 103 needs a reference at the end of the sentence
Answer: Done

Line 104 needs a reference at the end of the sentence
Answer: Done

Line 104 – should this be ‘greatest’? sentence done not read well.
Answer: Done

Line 110 needs a reference at the end of the sentence
Answer: Done

Line 112 needs a reference at the end of the sentence
Answer: Done

Lines 113-119 needs to be rewritten.
Answer: Done

Line 128 – provide actual date ie 1 January 2011.
Answer: Done

Line 128 – how do children under the age of 5 respond to the survey?
Answer: Done

Line 131 – ‘one year preceding the survey’ – does this depend on when they did the survey or for the year of 2010?
Answer: Done

Line 134 - Bangladesh Health and Injury Survey – Who is this?
Answer: Done

Line 135 - Twelve out of 64 districts were randomly selected for the survey. Was this across Bangladesh or within a specific area??
Answer: Done

Line 136 – Mothers as respondents implies that children were not surveyed, that mothers were survey about their children?
Answer: Done

Line 137 – Can you provide an example of the most knowledgeable member of the household.
Answer: Done

Line 139 - This is different to above, where you say the preceding year. Also need time frame.
Answer: Done

Line 141 – What did you use to undertake the analysis.
Answer: Done
Line 143 - How did you do this with people who are illiterate?
Answer: Done
Lines 148-150 – This information should be in the introduction
Answer: Done
Line 151 – Drowning ???
Answer: Done
Tables and figure – choose which format you would like. Also I would suggest merging tables 1 – 5 and stratifying them by rural / urban (I think this is important and new information which should be describe in more detail. I would then include age / gender / time of day / etc. You also might like to do another table where you have drowning death vs non-fatal drowning and compare rates and other factors. You should also add in hospitalisation into a table as well as moderate and major and minor severity (these terms also need to be defined). Line 154 – you use the term ‘moderate in severity’ you need to define this in the methods. The results need to start with a statement along the following line: There were X drowning deaths identified in the survey over the 2 year period, these were match to Y controls. This was an over rate of child drowning death of z for the period X-Y…
A rates table would be useful, describing the population by age sex and rural vs urban including deaths and population.
Answer: Done
Line 163 and 164 disagree with each other.
You need to include ion the methods your definitions for activity of children prior to drowning, swimming ability, activity of mother, etc.
The strongest predictor of the child drowning appears to be when they are not with their mother (an odds ratio of 25). Do you have any additional information about who was with the child?
Answer: Done
Line 179-180 there is a mistake in the rates somewhere, I think the male rate as not possible to have 156 if male is 32.4 as normally higher than females.
Answer: Done
Line 211 this is the first mention of how you calculated death rates, this needs to go in the methods and be expanded and I also thought you were using survey data?
Answer: Done
The conclusion should not introduce new information and should be a summary of the major points of the paper – see PDF for comments. Also it needs to be rewritten in parts – see PDF.
Some of the references are old and there are now newer reference, especially
the WHO World Drowning Report. I would delete the figures as do not add value.

Answer: Done

Discretionary Revisions

Line 50 – I would rewrite to be Drowning is a significant contributor to disability and premature death worldwide, with children from low- and middle-income countries the most vulnerable.

Answer: Ok, Done

Lines 72-75 do not read well – see PDF for suggestions

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 82 should read ‘drowning accounts for a higher mortality rate than any other ???’ add in what this is compared to and the reference.

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 83 ‘Who is at risky group.’ should read ‘Who is at risk:’

Answer: Ok, Done

Lines 83-85 needs a little work – see PDF

Answer: Ok, Done

Lines 86-88 needs a little work – see PDF, also needs a reference and aslo needs what location it refers to, e.g. worldwide, asia, LMIC etc.

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 87 – is it drowning incidents or drowning deaths?

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 89 would read better as: Every half an hour in Bangladesh a child drowning, this is 50 drowning deaths a day and 18,225 drowning deaths per annum[3].

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 95 to 96 propose rewording to: ‘The drowning death rate for Bangladeshi rural children is 156.4 per 100,000.’ Also need to add reference

Answer: Ok, Done

Lines 91-105 – long paragraph would be good to be broken into 2.

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 107 – injury is not a killer, it is the biggest cause of death of …

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 108 – add ‘is’ between danger and from

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 123 – change done to undertaken

Answer: Ok, Done

Line 125-127 - Minor suggestions – see PDF
Line 130 - Minor suggestions – see PDF
Answer: I already rewrite inaccroding to your given suggestion and also checkeb by one native english speaker. Thanks for your time
Regards
Richard
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests