Reviewer's report

Title: Operative Management of Cryptorchidism: Guidelines and Reality - a 10-Year Observational Analysis of 3587 Cases

Version: 2
Date: 17 November 2014
Reviewer: Claudio Spinelli

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary Revisions

In my opinion there are two points to improve in the text.

1. Introduction, page 3, lines 68-72.

Actually, current opinion in literature recommends hormone therapy as an adjuvant to orchiopexy [see Jallouli M, Rebai T, Abid N et al (2009). Neoadjuvant gonadotropin-releasing hormone therapy before surgery and effects on fertility index in unilateral undescended testes. A prospective randomized trial. Urology 73:1251-1254.]. It has recently been demonstrated that hormone therapy is especially beneficial in selected cases: Spinelli et al. [see Spinelli C, Strambi S, Busetto M, Pucci V, Bianco F. Effects on normalized testicular atrophy index (TAln) in cryptorchid infants treated with GnRHa pre and post-operative vs surgery alone: a prospective randomized trial and long-term follow-up on 62 cases. Pediatr Surg Int. 2014 Oct; 30(10):1061-7] showed that patients with a TAln >20% treated with pre-operative and post-operative GnRHa therapy have a significant increase in testicular volume after 5 years of follow-up. I think it would be better to expand the introduction by entering these matters.


In current clinical practice, the diagnosis of retractile testes does not allow us to a priori exclude the surgical treatment, and therefore does not justify this delay. The indication for surgical correction is represented by the asymmetry in volume between the two testicles. A paper by Niedzielski et al. [Niedzielski J, Pisarska K, Przewratil P (2003) The usefulness of testicular atrophy index in the assessment of undescended testicle-preliminary report. Rocz Akad Bialymst 48:112–124] suggest that a difference of more than 20% in volume between testes should be considered as an indicator for surgical intervention even in the presence of retracted testes. This criterion is used in the same way also for the treatment of varicocele [see Spinelli C, Di Giacomo M, Lo Piccolo R et al (2010) The role of testicular volume in adolescents with varicocele: the better way and time of surgical treatment. J Urol 184:1722–1726]. Please consider these assessments in the discussion.
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.