Reviewer's report

Title: Impact of physical activity on energy balance, food intake and choice in normal weight and obese children in the setting of acute social stress: A randomized controlled trial

Version: 3
Date: 13 October 2014
Reviewer: Jillon S Vander Wal

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Results, section on energy balance, second sentence (289-292): The information added in parentheses is confusing because the sentence pertains to differential caloric intake between the physical activity and sedentary arms, but the part in parentheses pertains to differences between NW and OW/OB children. Also, conflicting statistics are presented two sentences later. Please separate and clarify this information or just refer the reader to the table.

2. Discussion, limitations, fourth sentence (405): The authors note that the failure to blind staff might have attenuated group differences. However, it's more likely that non-blinded staff would tend to err in the direction of the study hypotheses, thereby accentuating between group differences.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Study design, first sentence (156). Figure 1 is referenced, but this reviewer did not receive Figure 1.

2. Please include the response to comment 7 in the first round of reviews in text, i.e., “Conners’ 3 and the Alabama Parenting Questionnaire have been officially translated into French and both are widely used in Europe (e.g., Farré-Riba & Narbona, 1997 for Conners’ 3; Essau et al., 2006 for APQ). The DEBQ has been translated and validated for French language use (Lluch et al., 1996; Strien & Oosterveld, 2008).”

3. Results, section on impulsivity-hyperactivity, second sentence (309): It isn’t clear if “they” refers to the parents or to the children. Please clarify.

4. Discussion, fourth paragraph (362): Please add the word “possibly” before “due to the lack of power” as this is speculation.

Minor Issues Not for Publication

1. Abstract, background, last sentence (40): Please add a comma after “intake.”

2. Abstract, method, first sentence (45): Please change “7-11 year old” to “7- to
11-year-old.”

3. Background, second paragraph, second sentence (83): Please add a comma after “leptin.”

4. Background, fifth paragraph, last sentence (117): Please add a comma after “monitoring.”

5. Background, last paragraph, third sentence (125): Please remove “the” before “food.” Also, please divide the sentences listed as a, b, and c with semicolons rather than periods (124-129; as was done in the methods section, first paragraph). Please add a comma after “impulsivity” (127), and remove “the” after “food” (128).

6. Methods, first paragraph, part (e; 142): Please remove “child is” to preserve parallel sentence structure.

7. Methods, second paragraph, first line: Please remove “in” after “opted.”

8. Study design, first paragraph, third sentence (158): Please change “where” to “when” as it is in reference to time.

9. Study design, second paragraph, first sentence (168): Please change “basket ball” to “basketball.” If two words are preferred, that’s fine, but then please change each occurrence of “basketball” to “basket ball.” Second sentence (line): Please add a comma after “PE specialist.” Third sentence (line): Please add a comma after i.e. Second to last sentence (line): Please add a comma after “books.”

10. Study design, fourth paragraph (187, 188): Please add commas after “pictures” and “games.”

11. Measures, food intake and choice (202): Please remove “up” as it isn’t necessary. Same paragraph, last line, please change “amount” to “number.” “Number” refers to things that can be counted such as calories. “Amount” refers to things than cannot, such as flour.

12. Energy expenditure: Please change “children-specific” to “child-specific” (215). Please change MET to METs (lines 218-221), please change “basket ball” to “basketball” (220), and please add a space between the numbers of minutes and “min (218, 219, 220).”

13. DEBQ: Please remove the space before the colon (229). Also, in the last sentence, add a comma after “reliability” and change “have” to “has” as the subject “structure” is singular.

14. Data analysis: Please add commas after “intake” (264), “balance” (266) and “behavior” (line 272). Please clarify the sentence beginning with “Differences between randomization arms...” The last part of that sentence doesn’t seem to fit, beginning with “and for weight category.” Perhaps divide it into two sentences.
15. Results, first paragraph, third sentence (281): Please change “regards” to “regard.”

16. Results, second paragraph (i.e., energy balance, food intake/choice), last sentence: Please change “less” to “fewer.”

17. Discussion, second paragraph, fifth sentence (337): Please add an object after “This” or perhaps change to “These findings provide.”

18. Discussion, third paragraph: Please add commas after “peer stressors” (350) and “food intake” (354).

19. Discussion, sixth paragraph, first sentence: Add a comma after “behavior” (379)

20. Discussion, seventh paragraph: Please add a comma after e.g. (389)

21. Discussion, paragraph starting with “parenting techniques”: Remove the word “result” after “choice” (397)

22. Discussion, limitations, fourth sentence (405): Please change “was” to “were.”

23. Discussion, limitations, last sentence (419): Please add a comma after “test.”

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.