Reviewer's report

Title: Accuracy of Parent-Reported Information for Estimating Prevalence of Overweight and Obesity in a Race-Ethnically Diverse Pediatric Clinic Population Aged 3 to 12

Version: 3 Date: 30 September 2014

Reviewer: Alison M Buttenheim

Reviewer's report:

The authors have done an exemplary job responding to reviewer comments. My major outstanding concern is the use of +/- 1 inch and +/- 2 lbs as the cutoffs for "accurate" parent-reported height and weight regardless of child's age or size. I think it makes the age group comparisons in Table 2 for height and weight less meaningful. I appreciate the addition of the mean differences and the BMI percentile errors.

Major Compulsory Revisions

p.5, data source: It would be helpful to know if parents knew the study was about child weight when they were recruited by receptionists. This is particularly important given the inability to report a response rate for the survey.

Discretionary Revisions

p.11 - "whose child's EHR BMI percentile was >= 90" - why is 90 the cutoff here? I would think 85 would make more sense?

The finding about black children with no parent reported classification being significantly less obese/overweight is fascinating. You can imagine several different selection forces (mostly related to differential probability of returning a completed survey conditional on receiving one) that would produce that outcome. More generally, the missing data problem that I was concerned about in the original review was less about partially completed surveys (parents who could not or chose not to report child's height and weight) but selection bias in the overall sample.

Not a revision, but a request: I hope you are planning to do something with Survey Q5 on confidence in responses - very interesting!

Typo:

P.11, Sentence beginning "Parent perception of whether..." seems to be incomplete.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.