Reviewer's report

Title: Vitrectomy with Internal Limiting Membrane Peeling vs no Peeling for Macular Hole-induced Retinal Detachment (MHRD): a Meta-analysis

Version: 2

Date: 22 March 2015

Reviewer: Hyong Kwon Kang

Reviewer's report:

Su et al's article reports meta-analysis of 7 retrospective comparative studies, which examined the role of ILM peel in the management of retinal detachment resulting from a myopic macular hole. They found that peeling of ILM was associated with higher rates of retinal reattachment and hole closure, and a lower rate of recurrent retinal detachment. They found no difference in visual outcome or the rate of complications in the two groups. This report is interesting because it deals with a condition that is relatively uncommon in western nations. It is commendable that the authors attempted to assess the quality of the reported data by evaluating the studies using predefined indices.

Overall comment

*The authors are advised to pay more attention to expression and grammar, and to avoid unnecessary repetition.

*Report by Shukla et al appears to include different population than the rest of the studies. The axial lengths are normal and refractive data are not available. It is notable that Shukla's data appear to show outcomes that are consistently against the trends shown by other studies. It may be justifiable to exclude this report from pooled analysis and limit the meta-analysis on myopic macular hole cases.

*Figures 2-5 represent the core of this report and need improvement. The horizontal axis for odds ratios appear to be mislabelled. The figures need to have clear headings that show the parameter being presented.

Specific comments

*Page 3, Line 92: misspelt 'study design'

*Page 3, Line 104: clarify '…scoring system as use in the quality comparison…'. Should it be ‘was used’?

*Page 3, Line 112: '(3) it dual (or multiple)…' should be clarified. Suggest '(3) If multiple studies were reported by the same…the best quality or the most recent…'

*Page 4, Line 133: clarify continuous data being presented in median and range values. Does this mean the distribution was non-parametric?

*Page 4, Line 152: The first sentence needs revision and clarification.

*Page 5, Line 202, 203: conventionally written as 'pars plana vitrectomy'
The cited publication (30) deals with surgery for foveal detachment and retinoschisis in high myopes, of which one case developed full-thickness macular hole. The risk of macular hole formation when dealing with macular hole cases may not be relevant, unless the authors are referring to the development of new full-thickness defect elsewhere in the peeled region.

The last sentence of previous paragraph and the first sentence of the following paragraph deal with similar points and should be amalgamated. It should be understood that myopic macular hole-induced retinal detachment is relatively uncommon, which means that large scale studies or randomised studies are unlikely to be performed.

clarify the statement, e.g., '…which exhibited significant baseline difference in the duration…'

by now readers will be familiar with macular hole-induced retinal detachment. The alternative name is not required, which was already provided in the introduction.

Figures 2-3 should be cited.

suggest 'achieved' rather than 'resumed'. This sentence is a repeat of the sentence on lines 233 to 236 and should be considered for removal.

delete 'during PPV'.

Figure 4 should be cited.

'developed' rather than 'occurred'.

clarify 'cocal electroretinogram'.

Figure 5 should be cited.

The statement 'This is not surprising because...' is not based on evidence and does not add new information to the report.

'included in' rather than 'including'

should be 'Therefore, vitrectomy with ILM peeling…'

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests