Reviewer’s report

Title: Clinicopathological variables influencing overall survival, recurrence and post-recurrence survival in resected stage I non-small-cell lung cancer

Version: 0 Date: 09 Dec 2019

Reviewer: joaira bakkach

Reviewer's report:

I reviewed the paper by Wang et al. The main objective of this work is to investigate the prognostic value of clinicopathologic factors and histologic subtypes in the overall survival, overall recurrence, and PRS in resected stage I non-small-cell lung cancer. The manuscript is well written and the data is convincing. However, there are some points listed as follows possibly needed to be further improved.

General remarks: Replace the terms by their abbreviations in the whole text: post-recurrence survival, lung adenocarcinoma, adenocarcinoma in situ, minimally invasive adenocarcinoma, overall survival...

Abstract

Methods: " …The effecting…” please replace by "the effect"

Results: " …Taking the clinicopathological variables on PRS into consideration …" Taking the effect of clinicopathological variables on PRS into consideration …"

Background

"Reported locoregional recurrence rates elevated …and range with various… " I propose: Reported locoregional recurrence rates were shown to elevated …and to range with various

"Appropriate surveillance strategies is … to screen and identify the early detection of recurrent patients who have the high probability of mortality. " Please correct: Appropriate surveillance strategies are … identify earlier and to screen recurrent patients who have the high probability of mortality

"…several studies have reported the role of the new classification on the prognostic value to predict mortality and recurrence mainly on LUAD or non-LUAD" I propose: …several studies have reported the prognostic value of the new classification to predict mortality and recurrence mainly in LUAD or non-LUAD
"With regard to recurrence modalities" I think recurrence patterns is more adequate here

"We could explore and identify the risk factors on the overall survival…" please modify: could identify the risk factors and explore their effect on the OS…

Methods

"Exclusion criteria were that patients had received" Please modify: Exclusion criteria were patients who had received…

"The clinic follow-up" Please replace by: clinical follow-up

"if abnormal symptoms occurred to be noticed" I propose: if abnormal symptoms were noticed

"… the prognostic value of clinicopathologic variables on the overall survival … " I propose: …the prognostic value of clinicopathologic variables in the OS…

Results

The lung adenocarcinoma classification lacks the MIA (12) subtype. Please include this in the text.

"… (21.7%) had developed the recurrence…” please modify: had developed recurrence

"The 5-year overall recurrence for all stage I patients were about 20.2%." This sentence is mentioned twice. Please delete one.

Authors stated that 230 patients had distant recurrence. Moreover, it was mentioned that the most commonly involved organs for distant recurrence were the lung (n=193), brain (n= 82), bone (n=85) and liver (n= 30). The total here is 390 cases and not 230 patients.

Other treatments details are presented in Table 2. Please insert this sentence to avoid any confusion.

"We further the explored risk factors" please correct : We further explored risk factors

"Taking the clinicopathological variables on PRS into the account"

Discussion

"To our knowledge, this present study is the first to comprehensively explore the clinicopathologic factors on oval survival…” To our knowledge, this present study is the first to comprehensively explore the influence of clinicopathologic factors on OS…
"The prognostic value of the new IASLC/ATS/ERS classification system on …" please modify: … classification system in…

"…who experienced the operation…" I suggest: …who underwent the surgery…

"…possibility of recurrence similar to the reported results…" please modify: …similarly to …

"…we could find it was within the first two years after the curative-intent surgical section that the most recurrences or disease progression appeared…” please modify: we found that most recurrences or disease progression appeared within the first two years after the curative-intent surgical section…

"…is still to be warranted to investigated and validated in case of excessive medical treatment or delayed the illness due to insufficient diagnosis” please modify: still warrants to be investigated and validated in case of excessive or delayed medical treatment

"… which needed more medical care for the postoperative clinical contact…” which highlights the need for more medical care for the postoperative clinical contact

"….the most effective treatment modalities … studies have reported the incidence …" please modify: …the most effective treatment modality… studies have reported an incidence

"We examined the clinicopathological variables on overall survival and overall recurrence in stage I NSCLC and identified a number of risk factors ….were significantly associated with worse overall survival" Please modify: We examined the impact of clinicopathological variables on OS and overall recurrence and identified a number of risk factors that were significantly associated with worse OS including the older age.…

"Shimada et al demonstrated that liver metastasis…”please insert the reference for this statement "…facilitated the quality of life and survival benefit…”

"…. the present study had three limitations. First, the retrospective nature of the current study had its limitation to assess …" I propose: the present study had some limitations. First, the retrospective nature hinders us to assess…

Conclusion

Authors repeat here the same conclusion of the abstract. Please reformulate the context and add some perspectives of your study

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes
Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.
I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal