Reviewer’s report

Title: Rectal aberrant crypt foci (ACF) as a predictor of benign and malignant neoplastic lesions in the large intestine

Version: 1 Date: 21 May 2019

Reviewer: Ian Tomlinson

Reviewer's report:

The topic of the relationship between ACFs and colorectal neoplasia is interesting and has been addressed periodically over the years. This study has promise, but the presentation makes it very hard for the reviewer to understand whether rectal ACF numbers - are these standardised in some way to rectal area? - are associated with the presence of adenomas, advanced adenomas and other polyps, whether in the rectum or in the regions of the colon. A more comprehensive and clearer statistical analysis could be performed and shed some mechanistic light on the pathogenesis of ACFs and their relationship to polyps. In addition, the Discussion would benefit from greater focus and the labelling of the graphs could be improved. Finally, a photo of the ACFs would help in determining their scoring accuracy.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

No

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited
Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal