Reviewer’s report

Title: Tumor-infiltrating CD8+ T cells combined with tumor-associated CD68+ macrophages predict postoperative prognosis and adjuvant chemotherapy benefit in resected gastric cancer

Version: 0 Date: 09 Apr 2019

Reviewer: Masaichi Ohira

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for giving me the opportunity to review your manuscript titled, "Tumor-infiltrating lymphocytes combined with tumor-associated macrophages predicts postoperative prognosis and adjuvant chemotherapy benefit in resected gastric cancer". Although this report is well-written and I believe that it involves suggestive information which help gastric surgeons to make some decisions in their daily practice, many reports has been reported about TIL and TAM in gastric cancer. I have some comments to the authors.

1. How was the regimen for PAC? You mentioned only"at least one cycle of 5 Fu-based PAC". What kind of drug was used and how was the duration of PAC, which was important factor in discussing prognosis in gastric cancer. From your result you can divide the patients of gastric cancer according to the state of TIL/TAM and do you think that PAC is unnecessary for patients in Type II and Type III or do you recommend not to use 5-Fu including regimen for Type II or III patients? And in such cases what kind of regimen do you recommend instead of 5-Fu including regimen?

2. There are various kinds of macrophages in the tumor. Is macrophage you described as TAM M1 macrophage or M2 macrophage? In cancer microenvironment infiltration of M2 macrophage is more important.

3. In Result the author described "Extension of the TNM staging system to include TIL/TAM status". But no explanation about the result is described in Result or Discussion. Please explain about the results precisely.

4. The author classified 0 to 3 according to the percentage of lymphocytes or macrophages infiltration. How did you calculate the percentage of TIL and TAM? What is the denominator of the percentage? Please explain precisely about calculation method of the percentage of TIL and TAM. In the FigureS1 it must be difficult to calculate the area of TIL or TAM.

5. Minor Comment: p7 line 4 esophageal cancer cases →gastric cancer cases
Table 1: Pathological Stage of CD8+TIL positive cases pathological stage II 84(20.9%) and III 182(41.0) are wrong

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal