Reviewer’s report

Title: Chemoradiotherapy versus chemotherapy as adjuvant treatment for localized gastric cancer: a propensity score-matched analysis

Version: 0 Date: 06 Jan 2018

Reviewer: Giovanni Grignani

Reviewer’s report:

Minor

English language needs to be reviewed

"we have added more information in this subject."

"to compare the efficacy and toxicity of CRT to CT alone as adjuvant treatment."

"Both groups had similar median OS and disease-free survival, with 5-year OS of 40.9% vs 41.3% for CRT and respectively (p=0.99) [18]."

Major

In the Toxicity paragraph and in the Discussion section, authors need to change the statement on "well tolerance" of post-op chemo or radiotherapy after a D2 gastrectomy. Indeed few lines later they reported a 50 % dose-reduction due to toxicity.

"Overall, both treatments were well tolerated with manageable toxicities but slightly different profiles of adverse events."

"Dose reductions were more common in the CT than in CRT group (52.4% vs. 11%)."

Authors should acknowledge in the Discussion Section that the retrospective nature and higher number of microscopically contaminated margins in the CRT group compared to CT one, is a major limitation of this study. One could argue in favor of CRT after R1 surgery

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.
Yes

**Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?**
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?**
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests**
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report
including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal