Reviewer’s report

Title: CD133+ Liver Cancer Stem Cells Resist Interferon-gamma-induced Autophagy

Version: 1 Date: 07 Oct 2015

Reviewer: Khalid Matalka

Reviewer's report:

The second review is little bit better than the previous version. The authors did not address the major specific points in the second version. The authors added more presentation but no changes in the text regarding autophagy and apoptosis. Whereas, the discussion part is still not sufficient and does not address the important results presented.

No discussion on why IFN-γ treatment induced a different behavior on low expressed CD133 cells with ATG5 silencing? For instance the last paragraph in the discussion section does not discuss anything and it needs to be rewritten (the English is awkward)!

No relation between autophagy and apoptosis and the crosstalk between the two processes in relation to IFN-γ were addressed.

Even though the authors in their letter mentioned that they added the number of replicates and repetition for each in vitro experiment should be mentioned in the figure legends but I do not see it!

Are the methods appropriate and well described?

If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?

If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes
Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?

If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?

If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors

I am able to assess the statistics

Declaration of competing interests

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments
which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal