Reviewer’s report

Title: Physical activity before and after breast cancer diagnosis and survival - The Norwegian Women and Cancer cohort study

Version: 1 Date: 29 June 2015

Reviewer: Ruth Patterson

Reviewer’s report:

This is a carefully performed analysis of the role of PA in breast cancer prognosis, conducted in a large sample of breast cancer survivors in Norway.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. It should be acknowledged that the exposure measurement (total PA) was entirely subjective and is not translatable. For example, a PA level of 5 cannot be made into a policy, public health, or clinical recommendation. In addition, this self-assessment may perform poorly in other countries/cultures/study samples where self-perception and self-rating of total PA may be less accurate or biased.

2. Please add data on the pre- and post-diagnosis PA measures (as well as change) to Table 1.

3. Perhaps I missed it, but I was unable to find the mean time post-diagnosis at which PA levels were assessed. Please ensure that this information is plainly provided.

4. The Discussion is extremely long, detailed, and somewhat repetitive; and could be considerably tightened without loss to value of the paper.

5. Six figures is somewhat excessive for an epidemiologic paper of associations. Recommend that several of the figures be removed.

6. For the last sentence of the Results in the Abstract, please indicate whether this interaction was statistically significant.

Minor Essential Revisions

7. Page 5: Under Statistical analyses: Contingency tables cannot be “conducted.”

Discretionary Revisions

8. None.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests