Reviewer’s report

Title: Helical Intensity-Modulated Radiotherapy of the Pelvic Lymph Nodes with a simultaneous integrated Boost to the Prostate - First Results of the PLATIN 1 Trial

Version: 2 Date: 3 August 2015

Reviewer: Takashige Abe

Reviewer’s report:

General comment

The authors reported the feasibility of combined irradiation of both prostate and pelvic lymph nodes in IMRT-based treatment. Although this paper is well written, there were several issues the authors should address.

Major compulsory revisions

1. How many patients received LHRH analogue therapy? The authors should describe the correct number of patients for each hormone therapy (LHRH analogue or bicalutamide). As you know, in the previous studies, LHRH analogue was used in the manner of neoadjuvant or adjuvant setting. Is there any reason why bicalutamide is allowed in this protocol? I am wondering why hormone therapy was not unified to LHRH analogue.

Minor essential revisions

1. In the manuscript, numerous abbreviations were used, such as PORT, IGRT, SIB etc. It is difficult for readers to read this manuscript. The authors should reconsider the number of abbreviations. In addition, some were spelled out only in abstract, and, for example, SIB or IGRT were not spelled out once through the manuscript. They should be spelled out when they firstly appeared in the paper.

2. As the authors commented, previous data regarding whole pelvic radiation therapy were conflicting. Although this protocol might be the strongest treatment for high risk prostate carcinoma, randomized phase 3 study would be needed to evaluate the benefit of whole pelvic radiation therapy in the setting of the recent IMRT and long adjuvant hormone therapy. Based on the result of this phase 2 study, do the authors plan to start a phase 3 study?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.