Reviewer’s report

Title: Neutrophil count is associated with survival in localized prostate cancer

Version: 3  Date: 8 April 2015

Reviewer: Marco De Velasco

Reviewer’s report:

The objective of the manuscript submitted by Bahig et al., was to investigate the influence of systemic inflammation using leucocyte counts and metabolic co-morbidities on OS for PCa patients after radiotherapy. The study retrospectively investigated the effects of age neutrophil and lymphocyte counts, neutrophil to lymphocyte ration CAPRA score, cardiac history, diabetes and use of statin on OS in patients with localized PCa after treatment with beam radiotherapy or brachytherapy. The authors report that neutrophil counts, age and CAPRA were independent predictors of OS. They conclude that neutrophils represent a systemic marker for inflammation and to be an independent predictor for localized PCa. The article is well written and scientifically sound. However, despite the large cohort, the findings provide little clinical significance because no cut-off values were possible form the cohort.

Major compulsory concerns

1. The authors state that neutrophil count is an independent prognostic factor for OS, however, the author do not provide a cut-off values therefore limiting the value of their observation.

2. The authors conclude that neutrophil counts represent systemic inflammation, however the NLR ration was not associated with mortality. The authors should discuss the in more detail. The authors should also include other known markers of inflammation for their analysis.

3. The authors need to include WBC.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests