Reviewer's report

Title: Adaptation of Magnetic Resonance Imaging and Stereotactic Irradiation for Management of Brain Metastasis Attenuated Benefits of Prophylactic Cranial Irradiation in Patients with Limited-Stage Small Cell Lung Cancer

Version: 3 Date: 28 January 2015

Reviewer: Paul Rava

Reviewer's report:

Again, this manuscript looks at a highly selected population of patients with limited stage SCLC and attempts to evaluate the role of PCI in the setting of MRI as previous data were obtained without effective imaging of the CNS. The authors have clearly summarized the results and discussed them. The conclusion made is that "no clear improvement in survival or BM incidence was observed following PCI". There is not enough evidence for this conclusion. The N in the PCI group is 29 (too small for any comparison). The non-PCI group has better characteristics that factor into survival and future development of brain metastases. While this has been discussed it cannot be overlooked as one of the main factors affecting the outcomes described between the groups. Also, only the 57 patients in the non-PCI group and the 28 patients in the PCI groups who had an MRI prior to treatment should be compared or evaluated. The addition of the other patients who do not have MRI further limits any discussion of outcomes as the premise of the study is that with MRI, current treatment standards may need to be re-evaluated.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.